



**STAFF REPORT**

**TO:** Chairman and Members of the Board of Architectural Review  
**FROM:** Department of Community Development  
**RE:** CDA13-20 144-148 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street Demolition  
**DATE:** November 15, 2013

---

Name:	<u>144-148 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street</u>	Location:	<u>Eastern edge of N 21<sup>st</sup> Street in Old Town</u>
Project:	<u>N/A</u>	Tax Map Number:	<u>/35A1/220///3/</u>
Address:	<u>144-148 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street</u>	Loudoun County PIN:	<u>488-37-5267</u>
Located in the Historic District?	<u>Yes</u>	Contributing Structure?	<u>Yes</u>
Zoning District:	<u>C-4/HC</u>	DHR ID:	<u>286-5001-0042</u>

---

Comments: Application to demolish 144-148 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street in anticipation of the construction of Vineyard Square (CDA13-11) a proposed 5-6 story, mixed-use building.

---

The application is evaluated under the Demolition Permit Criteria of the Historic Corridor Overlay District (see Article 14A, Section 8.3 in the Zoning Ordinance) and the Purcellville Design Guidelines (Guidelines).

**BACKGROUND**

Chapman Group, LLC has submitted an application to demolish 144-148 North 21st Street; this building has street frontage on North 21st Street. This demolition is sought as a precursor to the construction of Vineyard Square (CDA13-11), a proposed 5-6 story, mixed-use building containing residences and retail. The 0.569 acre parcel containing this building also contains 3 other buildings for which demolition approval is sought (CDA13-19 & CDA13-21 through CDA 13-22).



This building is listed as a structure contributing to the Purcellville Historic District which is listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The building is described within the original National Register nomination form thusly:

**0144 -148 21st Street North**

*Primary Resource Information:*  
**Commercial Building, Stories 1.00,  
Style: Commercial Style, 1930**

February 2006: This 1-story building features stuccoed pilasters on the front and north facades and a wood-shingle mansard-roof. The mansard roof is the result of the 1978 renovation of the building and continues to the building on the south. The front façade incorporates two distinct sections of three bays each, the northernmost of which features an inset door with dentils, flanked by a 9-pane, fixed window with sloping sills. The southernmost section of the building has a similar, recessed entrance with a pair of pedestrian doors that are flanked by 12-pane, fixed windows with sloping sills. The doors incorporate 9-lights over 3-lowered panels. The single loading bay at the rear of the building has been in-filled with concrete block, but retains the original wood lintel remains and is inscribed with “Kemp Building 1978.” There is a stuccoed, concrete block, exterior end chimney on the north façade and the majority of fenestration on that façade has been in-filled. Rear windows are a combination of 6-over-6, double hung and 1-over-1, double hung windows.

*Individual Resource Status:* **Commercial Building - Contributing**



*Building from N 21<sup>st</sup> Street*  
northern portion; southern portion is 140-142 N 21<sup>st</sup> Street



*Rear (east side) of building*

**ANALYSIS**

**ZONING ORDINANCE**

Per Article 14A, Section 2.3 of the Zoning Ordinance, no building within the Historic Corridor Overlay Zoning District “shall be... demolished, in whole or in part, unless and until a certificate of design approval authorizing such work shall have been approved in accordance with this article.” Section 8.3 of Article 14A provides the following criteria to be considered by the Board of Architectural Review (BAR) in reviewing demolition applications:

- (1) “The designation of the particular structure as historic or non-historic by a qualified historic preservation professional or by a government-recognized historic survey;”

*This building is listed as a contributing structure for the Purcellville Historic District which is listed on the National Register of Historic Places; however, the building is not individually listed as historic on any government historic survey.*

- (2) “The context of the structure in relation to surrounding buildings and landscape on the site and adjacent and nearby sites; and”

*This building is located in Old Town amidst other buildings constructed in the early to mid-1900s which line North 21st Street. These buildings are constructed from a range of materials and are generally 1-2.5 stories in height. The land to the east of 21<sup>st</sup> slopes away from the road.*

- (3) “The appropriateness, as determined through application of applicable design criteria and guidelines, of proposed structures, which will replace the demolished structure, if any.”

*See CDA13-11 Vineyard Square staff report.*

## **GUIDELINES**

The Guidelines provide the following guidance: “The Town Comprehensive Plan supports the preservation of the town’s historic resources to the greatest extent possible. Thus, the Board seeks to retain the existing historic fabric of the Town, while balancing the needs of property owners to make contemporary use of their property.” (pg. 31) The Guidelines authorize the Town Zoning Administrator to determine when a building has historic significance based upon certain criteria which automatically designate this building as historically significant.

The Guidelines state that “there must be a compelling reason to demolish or relocate a significant historic structure” with the Board considering the following criteria:

- a) “The extent to which the removal or relocation of the building or structure would be detrimental to the public interest due its architectural or historic significance.” (pg.32)

*This building has no particular architectural or historic significance.*

- b) “The extent to which the building or structure is of such old and unusual design, texture and material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty.” (pg.32)

*This building is constructed of concrete block. This material could be reproduced easily, and the building’s design is not particularly unusual.*

- c) “The extent to which retention of the building or structure or group of structures would help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the town.” (pg.32)

*This building’s date of construction is consistent with nearby buildings in Old Town; however, there is little else about this building that is distinctive.*

- d) “The extent to which the building or structure or group of structures represents a unique or rare example of an historic or architectural style or feature of Town or Loudoun County history.” (pg.32)

*This building does not represent unique or rare examples of an historic or architectural style or feature of Town or Loudoun County history.*

- e) “The extent to which retention of the building or structure would help maintain the scale and character of the neighborhood.” (pg.32)

*This building has a similar scale and character to other buildings along North 21st Street, but a newly constructed building could easily serve the same purposes.*

- f) “The extent to which retention or, in the converse, removal or relocation of the building or structure or group of structures supports goals, objectives or policies of the Town Comprehensive Plan.” (pg.32)

*As stated previously, the 2006 Town Comprehensive Plan strongly supports the preservation of the town's historic resources, yet the entire façade of 140-148 N 21st Street was specifically noted in the 2005 Purcellville Downtown Master Plan as one which could use a significant renovation. The proposed design went beyond rehabilitation and created features which were not historically present on the buildings.*

**FINDINGS**

- 1) The criteria of the Guidelines automatically designate the building as historically significant; the Zoning Administrator would otherwise determine that this building is not historically significant.
- 2) Excluding age, there are no distinctive or unusual features of this building that would make it architecturally or historically significant and warrant its preservation.

**ACTION:**

One of following sample motions should be used:

*I move that the BAR approve CDA13-20 144-148 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street Demolition as presented.*

*-Or-*

*I move that the BAR approve CDA13-20 144-148 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street Demolition with the following required conditions:*

- A.
- B.
- C.

*And/or the following recommendations:*

- A.
- B.

*-Or-*

*I move that the BAR not approve CDA13-20 144-148 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street Demolition for the following reasons:*

- A.
- B.
- C.